

COLLAGE TEXT

Image 1

Top left corner: “MOCA TALKS: Mae Ngai in conversation with Beth Lew-Williams.” Mae Ngai and Mae Ngai’s book *The Chinese Question: The Gold Rushes and Global Politics* are pictured side-by-side.

Top middle: Text conversation with NYU News contributor. It reads: “They deleted the part I wrote where you talked about your reaction to academia. Like the Mae Ngai Stuff. Sorry it didn’t make it in.” Pictured: Link to NYU News article “Demonstrators boycott Chinatown museum to protest new mega jail.”

Top right corner: Screenshot of Change.org petition titled “An Appeal for Healing at MOCA and Chinatown.”

Below top left corner: Screenshot of Jacobin’s podcast “The Dig: No Human Being Is Illegal with Mae Ngai.”

Below top right corner: List of main signatories on the above Change.org petition against the picket line: “Charlotte Brooks (Baruch) * Karlin Chan (Founder, Chinatown Block Watch) * Dallas Chang, Artist * Tisa Chang, Pan Asian Repertory Theater * Jessica Chao * David S. Chen * May Y. Chen * Emily Cheng, Artist * Lana Cheung, Local 23-25 Workers United * Julisa Chin * Margaret M. Chin (Hunter/CUNY Graduate Center) * Rocky Chin * Sylvia Fung Chin, Esq. * Winifred C. Chin (NYU) * Chinatown Business Improvement District * Chinatown Partnership LDC * Marilyn Chou * Dulcie Dee, Artist * Lotus Do, Artist * Dian Dong * Thomas Drysdale (NYU) * Kip Fulbeck (UC Santa Barbara) * Gary Gach * Larry Hama, Writer, Cartoonist, Actor & Musician * Alex Hing * David Ho * Gregory P. Ho * Alice Hom * Evelyn Hu-DeHart (Brown) * Jacqueline Huey * Shirley Hune (UW) * David Henry Hwang, Playwright * Victor & Lucy Kan * Rebecca Karl (NYU) * Christopher Kwok, Esq. * Eugenia Lean (Columbia) * Ana Paulina Lee (Columbia) * Bob Lee, Asian American Arts Centre * Hong Shing Lee * Jennifer Lee (Columbia) * Kin-Wah Lee (Board Member & Co-Founder, UA3) * Mae Lee * Regina Lee * Sokie Lee * Robert G. Lee (Brown) * Russell Leong * Lydia Liu (Columbia) * Chi Loek * Tzi Ma, Actor * Sumita S. Mukhi * Naoto Nakagawa, Artist * Virginia L. Ng * Mae Ngai (Columbia) * Lien-Hang T. Nguyen (Columbia) * Cao O * Elizabeth R. OuYang, Civil Rights Attorney, Educator & Advocate * Perry Pong, M.D. * Carolyn Queener * Edgar Romney (Workers United SEIU) * Chung Seto * Van C. Tran (CUNY Graduate Center) * Kathy S. Wong * Katie Ho & Kin Wong * John Woo, Asian CineVision * Alice Young, Esq. * Mel & Richard Young * Justin Yu, Chinese Chamber of Commerce * Eleanor Yung * Madeleine Zelin (Columbia)”

Below podcast screenshot: Excerpt from [Curbed.com](#) article that reads, “The conflict has split along sometimes surprising lines. Old resentments have reemerged, then mutated. One former Basement Workshop member, Rocky Chin (no relation to Margaret Chin), has emerged as MOCA’s fiercest defender; he compared the current fight to the ones that broke up the Workshop and equates defending MOCA with defending the idea that people like him matter. [Underlined in red] “As a Chinese American, MOCA reflects the aspiration of having an organization with staff that will have the ability to tell our stories,” [Underline ends] he said. “I don’t have too much hope that big institutions are going to do that.”

He and former MOCA board member Cao O released a public statement in support of the museum this past summer. It contained signatures from prominent Chinese Americans including actor Tzi Ma, Asian American–studies scholars Russell Leong and Mae Ngai, and longtime labor activist Alex Hing. [Underlined in red] “I signed on because I know about these self-righteous, deluded people who are now attacking MOCA,” [Underline ends] Hing told me. Despite his pro-labor stance, Hing has clashed with CSWA and its director, Wing Lam, in the past. (As for what Lam thinks, I can’t tell you. When I reached out to him for this story, I was told by a CSWA staffer that Lam refused to speak with me unless I “renounced” my former employer CAAAV’s position on a rezoning plan from 2008. Later, they denied it had anything to do with CAAAV. Either way, Lam didn’t want to talk to me.)”

Below NYU News text message: Photograph of a protester and the summons ticket just handed to her, with the three cops behind her

To the right of the summons photograph: Another protester with her summons ticket in one hand and sign in the other

To the right of the second summons photograph: Black and white photo collage of the “MOCA 8” who were harassed by MOCA and NYPD, center of collage reads “MOCA 8: Guilty for protesting MOCA for selling out Chinatown”

Below the Curbed article excerpt: Cover of Rebecca Karl’s book titled “Mao Zedong and China in the Twentieth-Century World: A Concise History.”

Bottom middle: Screenshot of NYU website titled “Rebecca Karl, Professor of History” with a photograph of Rebecca Karl.

Left side: Screenshot of Facebook message sent to Rebecca Karl from Yolanda Zhang, an organizer, MOCA protester, and previous student of Rebecca Karl. The text outlines the crimes of MOCA and MOCA board co-chair Jonathan Chu, including MOCA's racial and sexual harassment of protesters, and urges Karl to rescind her support of MOCA and join the picket line

Facebook message:

"Hi Professor Karl, sending here a video I personally took back in August/ September speaking to the immigrant women workers protesting MOCA, assuming you know Mandarin (and some Cantonese) very well.

Workers mostly commented on MOCA's board co-chair Jonathan Chu, who, in addition to evicting Jing Fong from his commercial property, also lent an Asian American face to our White mayor De Blasio's plan of expanding the new Chinatown jail, actively selling out not just Asian but Black and Brown residents and workers in Chinatown and LES. And if we wanna dwell on just the issue of jail more - MOCA, despite its alleged lip service paid to "anti-jail" rhetoric, has walked the opposite walk: if the jail is a "done deal" as Rocky Chin and perhaps Mae Ngai irresponsibly claimed, then why did the \$35 million "giveback" not go to just anyone or small biz on the street but that a good chunk of it (\$35 out of \$50 M) was in fact given to MOCA? Tell me what the implication is. (How dare Asian American representatives like Chin and Ngai claim it's a "done deal," denying the political agency of current tenants and workers, downplaying the life-and-death issue struggled by people of color?) If Museum's leadership and former investment banker Nancy Yao truly cares about the City's funding disparities concerning the Asian American community, she would NOT have green lighted Mayor De Blasio's exact racist, second class-citizen treatment of Manhattan Chinatown - while institutions in other neighborhoods successfully apply and unconditionally receive public funding, Nancy Yao not only accepted De Blasio's condescending conditions of jail expansion and potential real estate giveback plan in Chinatown - but she took the money and played as the "victim" using the budgetary discourse. She then accused all those who suffers the aftermath of her racist collusion with the City- namely the Chinatown and LES residents - as "uneducated," "not knowing what is written on their protest signs," even "paid by politicians." Most recently, her Museum has sent out white, predatory staff member to control the predominantly Asian picketers. The staff grabbed one of my dearest friends by her BARE waist back in July, with press coverage. Months later, last week, he cyber-stalked her again and threatened that he knows where she lives. This is a truly toxic sexual harassment culture that the Museum is not only well-aware of - but actively encouraging. Museum owes my friend and ALL members of the community an apology.

We're very disappointed at the disinformation spread in the academic circle. We hope you'd reconsider your stance and urge your colleagues and students to, too. Here is a recent open letter to all faculty and students: [https:// medium.com/@academics_ again st_displacement/boycott-moca-ope n-letter-to-the-academic-commu](https://medium.com/@academics_again/st_displacement/boycott-moca-open-letter-to-the-academic-commu)

Yolanda Zhang: Of course, one might be quick to dismiss the issue at hand as a "small" albeit "complicated" polemic (or worse, "Asian infighting," deemed by some MOCA sympathizers) - so why is it worthy of any scholarly attention or potential burning bridges? Well the MOCA vs. Jing Fong workers' picket line should be a wakeup call to all of us, as it serves as a concrete example of how Asian American elites and their social circle willingly participate in the system's maintaining and concealing of racism (via Asian-American landlords and displacers), manifested in mass incarceration, targeted displacement of the last foothold of multiracial working-class neighborhoods, etc. It also clearly shows how the knowledge and authoritative representation of the grassroots community through "cultural identity" is nowadays disgustingly co-opted and tokenized by institutions like MOCA and its sympathizers, who profit over supposedly "progressive" pro-AAPI rhetorics while celebrating a racist process of gentrification-not to mention that it also breeds a hostile, misogynist culture in the interim. In the end, what cheers me up is that the community is actively speaking out and making demands, and it's up to you to join them. So, I take it back - the question over MOCA is not just a life-and-death issue for the working people in Chinatown - it is a life-and-death issue for the moral compass of the entire academia. We hope you take the right stand, and join the picket line.

Yolanda Zhang: List of Jonathan Chu's owned properties, all commercial - 46-48 Bowery a/k/a 14-18 Elizabeth Street China Arcade LLC. Block 202 Lot 25 Biggest tenant is Jing Fong Restaurant 50 Bowery 50 Bowery Holdings LLC Block 202 Lot 23 Former location of Silver Palace Restaurant Current location of Hotel 50 Bowery NYC 62-68 Bowery a/k/a 155 Canal Street Canal Holdings L.L.C. Block 203 Lot 31 Biggest tenant is TD Bank 221-227 Canal Street a/k/a 112-114 Baxter Street 221 Canal Street LLC Block 207 Lot 20 Biggest tenant is Chase Bank Another tenant is Chikarashi - a poke restaurant chain whose owners include Jonathan Chu and his wife Ivy Tsang 233-237 Canal Street a/k/a 168 Centre Street.”

To the right of “China’s Revolutions” book cover: Three screenshots of Signal messages between the same protester and Rebecca Karl. Message proceeds the earlier Facebook message, Zhang expresses outrage at the silence from Karl regarding previous messages and the video of Jing Fong workers. Karl responds claiming that Zhang is “parodying her.”

Yolanda Zhang: “Rebecca Karl It’s been some days since I showed you the video of the Jing Fong workers, and we’re actually offended by your silence...MOCA’s Nancy Yao went as outrageously as to put down the workers by comparing them to an irrational mob finding an outlet of their anger.Your silence is doing the same here...The laid off workers have been [image cuts off]”

Cont. second image from Zhang: “East Side...Can’t believe YOU, Rebecca Karl, also look down on workers! Also look down on women, who are being grabbed and flirted with by the MOCA staff outside their door! Shame on you! Shame on the kind of academic left you represent!”

Third image, response from Rebecca Karl: “Yup, that’s me. You know me well, evidently. You’ve been in my classroom and my home and you know full well you’re parodying me. I’m not going to respond in this forum to your provocation. I’m sorry to disappoint.”

To the right of the Facebook message: Cover of Rebecca Karl’s book “China’s Revolutions in the Modern World.”

Below the “China’s Revolutions” book: Letter accompanying the [Change.org](#) petition in support of MOCA and against the picket line which urges the Chinatown community to “come together” in regards to the jail expansion plan supported by MOCA.

“We are concerned New Yorkers and friends with long-standing interests in the well-being and future of Chinatown, from poverty alleviation and labor rights to economic development, from health care access and civic participation to educational opportunities, and from promotion of the arts to the preservation of Chinese American history and cultural heritage.

We support the Museum of Chinese in America (MOCA), including its pursuit of a larger and permanent home. We oppose the Mayor’s plan to construct a larger jail in Chinatown. But we do NOT support blaming MOCA for the City’s decisions about the jail. We certainly do NOT condone the boycott of MOCA, the weekly pickets in front of the museum, and the harassment of artists who are participating in MOCA’s current exhibit. These protests are misguided and harmful to MOCA and to the community.

We support the continued fight against the expansion of the Chinatown jail. We urge that protests be directed at City Hall (Mayor & City Council), not MOCA. MOCA is a vibrant and robust cultural heritage institution with a long history that embraces and includes diverse narratives of Chinese-Americans. Their collections are important for the general public, researchers, and future generations.

While there are different views, opinions and interests involved, we seek to rebuild community solidarity and common ground based on civil and constructive engagement. Let’s stand together to support an important community institution that tells an important piece of the American story.”

Below Signal messages: Photograph of seven picketers with their signs outside of MOCA

To the right of petition letter: Photograph of sign from the picket line which reads “MOCA+THE CHU FAMILY ARE SO AFRAID OF THE CHINATOWN COMMUNITY THEY HAVE TO USE THEIR COP FRIENDS TO HARASS A PEACEFUL PICKET” and includes a drawing of

Jonathan Chu saying “I’M SO SCARED OF SOY SAUCE BUCKET DRUMS AND BEING HELD ACCOUNTABLE FOR SELLING OUT CHINATOWN! and Cop Vinny Cheung saying “DON’T WORRY JON, I’M HERE FOR YOU.”

Bottom right corner: Excerpt of Public Books interview with Mae Ngai titled “MAE NGAI: “WE’VE ALWAYS HAD ACTIVISTS IN OUR COMMUNITIES” Interview excerpt text: “JC: How are you thinking about your role as a historian in the midst of this anti-Asian racism?

Mae Ngai answers: “In this period after Atlanta with all the hate attacks on Asian Americans, a lot of us have been invited to talk to TV reporters and interviewed by newspapers. A lot of what you see is positive, because people are talking about a history that has remained so obscure for so many Americans. But a lot of it is a litany of how we have been attacked: There was this massacre, there was this attack. There was this town that burned down. It’s a long list of how we have suffered. And I think we can do better than that. I think we have to put it in the context of American politics. [Underlined in red:] We have to have a more sophisticated, more comprehensive, and more intersectional kind of analysis to offer. [Underline ends] That’s harder for people to process. It demands more work of the listener. But I think we should demand that of them.”

PAGE 3

Top right corner: Excerpt from the same Curbed Article, which reads “would perpetuate a broken system. The city calls the money it gave MOCA “community investment,” one of many given out in an attempt to make an unpopular plan more palatable; in Chinatown, a park and a senior-housing complex got some money too. But [Underlined in red:] the \$35 million earmarked for MOCA is by far the most promised to a single institution, not just in Chinatown but anywhere in the boroughs.[Underline ends]

Below Curbed excerpt: Photograph of three picketers outside of MOCA with their signs which read “MOCA SOLD OUT CHINATOWN FOR \$35M & A NEW JAIL”; “Nancy Yao apologize to Chinese Seniors”; “MUSEUM OF CHINESE IN AMERICA MORE LIKE...MUSEUM OVERSEEING CAPITALIST ASSIMILATION.”

Below Public Books interview: New York Times Op-ed by Mae Ngai titled “Immigration’s Border-Enforcement Myth.”

Excerpt from op-ed reads “Whichever vision prevails, restrictions on legal immigration will lead to more undocumented immigration from the global south. [Underlined in red] Idealized immigrants from Europe aren’t going to pick lettuce or wash dishes [Underline ends], just as most native-born white Americans don’t. And the nativists will have nothing more helpful to

propose than heartless policing and deportation to discipline an underclass of nonwhite people that their own policies created.” Credit reads “Mae Ngai is a professor of history at Columbia and the author of “Impossible Subjects: Illegal Aliens and the Making of Modern America.”

Bottom right corner: Photograph of MOCA picket line after soy sauce bucket “drums” have been seized by cops, picketers and cops face each other

Bottom left corner: Excerpt from Curbed article reads: “But as [Underlined in red] MOCA president Nancy Yao Maasbach [Underline ends] prepared to welcome journalists and luminaries to the show’s opening in July, about two dozen protesters gathered on the sidewalk. Fresh-faced high-school students and Chinese grandmas with sensible haircuts hoisted signs that read MUSEUM OF CORRUPT ASIANS and THE MUSEUM OF CORPORATE ARTWASHING and HEY MOCA! RETURN THE \$35 MILLION TO THE COMMUNITY! “*Sanqian wubai wan*,” they yelled—35 million.

Maasbach, dressed in a silky butter-yellow gown and cream-colored heels, exited the building and faced the protesters. “That’s not true, and that’s not true, nothing’s true,” Maasbach said, jabbing her finger at the signs. “They didn’t give us any money!” [Underlined in red:] She turned to a cluster of middle-aged immigrant women. “They’re using you,” she said to them in Mandarin before walking back indoors.” [Underline ends]